

MC

JERSEY CITIZENS' ASSEMBLY ON CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY  
PANEL

(2nd Meeting)

22nd February 2021 at 14.30 hours

**PART A (Non-Exempt)**

All members were present.

Professor L. Bentley, Chief Executive Officer, Royal Meteorological Society - Chair  
F. Barnes, retired (formerly Oxera and FCA)  
R. Harker, Head of Technology, Digital Jersey  
R. Diski, Lead of Just Transition Projects, New Economics Foundation  
J. Hopley, Chair, Jersey Energy Forum  
T. Park, Principal Advisor, Energy, Environment and Sustainability, Behavioural Insights Team

In attendance -

S. Skelton, Group Director, Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance (for a time)  
L. Magris, Head of Sustainability and Foresight, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance  
L. Jones, Senior Policy Officer, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance  
M. Clark, Secretariat Officer, States Greffe  
Deputy S.J. Luce of St. Martin, Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (observer)  
M. Magalhaes, Research and Project Officer, States Greffe (observer)  
E. Robbins, Chair Convener (elect), Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change (observer)  
D. Beddoes, Involve  
P. Keane, New Citizenship Project

Note: The Minutes of this meeting comprise Part A only.

Welcome and Introductions.

A1. The Chair, on behalf of the Panel, welcomed Ms. E. Robbins, Chair Convener (elect) of the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change to the meeting as an observer. It was unanimously agreed that it would be beneficial for Ms. Robbins to attend future meetings in this capacity.

The Panel noted that the Citizens' Assembly would be asked to formally endorse the appointment of Ms. E. Robbins as Chair Convener at its first meeting on 13th March 2021.

The Panel also welcomed Deputy S.J. Luce of St. Martin and Ms. M. Magalhaes of the States Greffe, who were attending on behalf of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel, which had been granted independent observer status for the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change.

Minutes.

A2. The Minutes of the meeting of 11th February 2021, having previously been

circulated, were taken as read and were confirmed.

Conflicts of interest.

A3. No conflicts of interest were declared by Members in respect of the matters to be discussed during the meeting.

Actions from last meeting.

A4. The Panel noted the following actions arising from the last meeting:

(1) Procedures for handling disagreements

It was agreed that any disagreement between Members would be voted upon by the Panel (with the Chair having a casting vote) and duly recorded in the meeting minutes, with individual Members' dissent being recorded if requested. In the event that the Government (or any officers, on behalf of the Government) object to a Panel decision or decline to accept Panel advice, this would also be recorded in the Minutes, along with the reasons for the objection;

(2) Requirement for additional Panel members

It was agreed that no additional Panel members were required at present, although specific expertise could be co-opted on to the Panel in future, if required. It was agreed that this could be particularly relevant in considering, for example, technical issues relating to the possible impacts of certain policy options on future generations. The Panel noted that a number of young people would be involved in the Citizens' Assembly process as presenters and that it was envisaged that they could also be asked to review factsheets and presentation materials to avoid any unintended generational bias;

(3) Use of Microsoft Teams

It was agreed that Teams was an appropriate means of sharing views and information amongst the Panel and Members confirmed that appropriate equipment had been made available; and

(4) Payment set up

Members were requested to sign and return the form indicating their acceptance of the Terms and Conditions for Supply Jersey to Ms. L. Jones by the 26th February.

Panel feedback, discussion and advice on design for Block 1.

A5. The Panel considered the proposed content for Block 1 of the Citizens' Assembly, details of which had been circulated to Members for comment before the meeting.

It was recalled that the creation of the Citizen's Assembly had been mandated in the Carbon Neutral Strategy, which had been adopted by the States Assembly in February 2020. The Carbon Neutral Strategy was noted to be the Government's response to a backbench proposition (P.27/2019 - Climate Change Emergency: Actions to be taken by the Government of Jersey) which had requested the States Assembly to acknowledge the existence of a climate emergency that was likely to have profound effects on the Island and, having done so, to draw up a plan for Jersey to become carbon-neutral by 2030.

The Panel was advised that the current policy position remained that adopted by the States Assembly in 2014: Energy Plan for Jersey 'Pathway 2050,' which had identified an initial set of actions and interventions designed to reduce carbon emissions by 80 per cent (measured against lower than 1990 levels by 2050). This target was in line with the commitment of other jurisdictions, including the UK, who were also signatories to the Kyoto Protocol. This position was acknowledged to be critical in properly framing of the deliberations of the Citizens' Assembly on

2nd Meeting  
22.02.21

Climate Change and the Panel agreed that the relevance of these dates should be explained in detail to participants during the first session.

Recognising that achieving carbon neutrality by 2030 would be an ambitious target, the Panel acknowledged that heating and transport would be important areas to address when the Assembly considered Scope 1 and 2 emissions. It was envisaged that the Citizens' Assembly would provide an important steer for Government on whether Jersey should act as a trailblazer and aim to become carbon neutral by 2030, fall into line with other jurisdictions that had already adopted 2050 as their target date, or indeed opt for a different target date.

The Panel considered that the information presented should ensure that the Citizens' Assembly formulated a sound understanding of the measures needed for the Island to become carbon neutral, the likely costs thereof and the available intervention measures, in order to provide an informed recommendation as to the preferred date for carbon neutrality to be achieved. Whilst it was agreed that Jersey's actions, in isolation, would not have a significant global effect, the position taken by other countries would also be a factor in Jersey's approach.

The Panel was advised that Block 1 was intended to be high level and would cover the main issues, outlining the nature of the decisions and recommendations that the Citizens' Assembly would be asked to make. This would include information about relevant actors, the responsibilities of states and individuals, the ladder of intervention and also general principles which should guide discussions, such as values, conversation guidelines and respect for the opinions of others.

It was envisaged that the essential content would be provided by speakers; the factsheets were intended to provide background information and direct participants to sources of additional data. Members were concerned about keeping discussions relevant to the overall objective and were assured that trained facilitators would guide sessions to ensure that all group conversations remained appropriately focused.

The Panel also recognised, however that if participants felt overly constrained by the process there was a risk of disengagement. The Panel asked that further consideration be given to capturing ideas and suggestions that might emerge during discussions and could be fed into the overall process. Other than in Block 1, it was noted that some flexibility had been built into the Assembly design and that participants would be able request further information or call additional speakers, should clarity be required in specific areas.

Panel  
feedback,  
discussion and  
advice on  
factsheets for  
Block 1.

A6. The Panel considered the factsheets to be provided to Citizens' Assembly participants in Block 1, which had already been circulated for review and comment, and made the following observations:

Introduction to Climate Change factsheet

Having considered adopting a more internationally-recognised definition of net-zero which did not focus exclusively on carbon, the Panel agreed that the definition should remain consistent with that adopted in the Carbon Neutral Strategy;

International Climate Response factsheet

The Panel noted the current position regarding the Paris Agreement and agreed that the factsheet should specify that Jersey was not currently a party, although negotiations were ongoing for the Agreement to be extended to the Island before the end of 2021;

Climate change: the local context factsheet

The Panel expressed the view that more specific local examples of climate change should be included, and Members agreed to contact Jersey Met and local insurance companies, who may be able to provide evidence of how this had manifested itself in the Island;

Carbon Neutral Strategy factsheet

Having considered the scope of the Citizens' Assembly in detail earlier in the meeting, the Panel made no further comment on the introductory factsheet, save that it should be clear that the Assembly was taking place as a consequence of the commitment made by the Island's Government;

Introduction to Sustainable Finance factsheet

The Panel acknowledged that the carbon impact of global companies headquartered in Jersey was considerably greater than that of local businesses and residents, however the Island's ability to significantly influence these emissions was limited. Members agreed that Sustainable Finance should be considered by the Citizens' Assembly, in view of the overall importance of the financial services industry to the Island. However it was a vast subject and it would not be appropriate to either discuss on a superficial level, nor for it to take up a disproportionate portion of Block 1. The Panel agreed that more work was needed on the content of the factsheet and accordingly consideration of Sustainable Finance issues should be moved to a later content block; and

How do we make de-carbonisation fair? A just transition factsheet

It was agreed that the Citizens' Assembly should consider issues of global, as well as local fairness, related to climate change. The Panel noted that the introductory sessions would invite participants to consider and agree definitions of values and the extent to which fairness should extend beyond Jersey's borders. These would be used later in the process to measure the extent to which the Citizens' Assembly's recommendations aligned with the values agreed at the start. The Panel agreed that an international perspective should be included and that it was important for this to be addressed in the first Content Block.

Officers undertook to make the necessary amendments to the factsheets as agreed and make revised versions available to the Panel at the earliest opportunity.

Panel feedback, discussion and advice on proposed speakers for Block 1.

A7. The Panel was reminded that, in selecting speakers to address the Citizens' Assembly, consideration had been given to a person's independence, ability to communicate, subject-matter expertise and availability. It was also considered appropriate to balance local and off-island speakers, recognising that the high-level content of Block 1 would result in a bias towards 'non-local' speakers. The Panel was cognisant of the challenges involved and supported the approach taken to speaker selection to date.

It was acknowledged that Government officials would be best-placed to speak on certain local matters, particularly relating to the anticipated financial implications for Islanders of certain policy options. The Panel remained mindful of the need for impartiality, but was comfortable that officers should participate in this way, to enable the Citizens' Assembly to make informed decisions.

The Panel noted that speakers on sustainable finance had yet to be identified and suggested that these should include people who could talk from a moral, ethical and consumer, as well as a corporate financial perspective. It was also recognised that there would be a degree of cross-over between speakers and interconnected subject areas, which was considered beneficial.

Any other

A9. The Panel noted the following additional matters:

2nd Meeting  
22.02.21

Business.

- (1) New Citizenship Project had commissioned a graphic recorder, who would capture some of the information and feedback from the Climate Conversation and share their illustrations, depicting some of the outputs from the Explore phase, in the first Citizens' Assembly session;
- (2) there had been a high level of public engagement in the Explore Phase with posts on discussion forums numbering several hundreds. Transport had proved to be a particularly popular feedback topic. The Head of Sustainability and Foresight and undertook to circulate relevant metrics to Members;
- (3) it was agreed that the Panel would reconvene formally on 8th March, to review the proposed content for Block 2 and the detailed plans for the first Assembly session on 13th March

There being no further business, the meeting concluded at 16.15 hours.