

MC

JERSEY CITIZENS' ASSEMBLY ON CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY
PANEL

(4th Meeting)

29th March 2021 at 14.30 hours

PART A (Non-Exempt)

All members were present, with the exception of T. Park, from whom apologies had been received.

Professor L. Bentley, Chief Executive Officer, Royal Meteorological Society - Chair

F. Barnes, retired (formerly Oxera and FCA)

R. Harker, Head of Technology, Digital Jersey

R. Diski, Lead of Just Transition Projects, New Economics Foundation (not present for part of item A6)

J. Hopley, Chair, Jersey Energy Forum

In attendance -

L. Magris, Head of Sustainability and Foresight, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance (for a time)

L. Jones, Senior Policy Officer, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance

M. Clark, Secretariat Officer, States Greffe

M. Magalhaes, Research and Project Officer, States Greffe (observer)

E. Robbins, Chair Convener, Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change (observer)

D. Beddoes, Involve

I. Ekkeshis, New Citizenship Project

Note: The Minutes of this meeting comprise Part A only.

Welcome and Introductions.

A1. Panel Members and attendees were welcomed to the meeting by the Chair, Professor L. Bentley, who noted that apologies for absence had been received from Mr. T. Park.

Minutes.

A2. Subject to Part A4 being amended to reflect that the Panel had endorsed the appointment of Ms. E. Robbins as chair Convener of the Jersey Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change, the Minutes of the meeting of 8th March 2021, having previously been circulated, were taken as read and were confirmed.

Conflicts of interest.

A3. Mr. Hopley advised the Panel of his connection with certain organisations (or individuals associated with them) who had made written submissions to the Citizens' Assembly. Given that none of these were direct relationships and no financial benefit could be derived therefrom, the Panel agreed that no conflict existed.

There were no other conflicts of interest declared in respect of the matters to be discussed during the meeting.

Actions from
last meeting.

A4. The Panel noted the following matters arising from the last meeting:

- (1) following feedback received from Panel Members who had been asked to review the introduction section of the design document, it was noted that some additional wording on Government policy had been included;
- (2) Members were thanked for their valuable feedback on the Block 2 speaker presentations and factsheets within a very short timeframe; and
- (3) since the last meeting, some Members had raised concerns regarding the content of the proposed presentation on Jersey's Energy Market. Accordingly, the Chair had emailed the Panel on 12th March seeking their approval for the recommendations to:
 - (a) remove the presentation from Block 1;
 - (b) invite Dr. L. Magris to speak to the Citizens' Assembly on the subject; and
 - (c) ask Dr. Magris to record a short video to summarise the factsheet 'An Overview of Jersey's Energy Market' and to be available to attend the Assembly question and answer session thereafter.

The Panel recalled that it had approved this course of action ahead of the Block 1 sessions and agreed that it should be minuted for transparency at the present meeting.

Update on
Citizens'
Assembly to
date.

A5. The Panel noted that Block 2 had commenced over the preceding weekend and the final session of this Block would take place on Wednesday 31st March. Thanks were expressed to the Panel Members who had participated by recording presentations and attending question and answer sessions.

The Panel was advised that the level of engagement and satisfaction recorded by participants had been excellent, with no drop-outs occurring between the first 2 blocks. The Panel Members who had been involved to date agreed that the Citizens' Assembly participants had not only displayed tremendous enthusiasm but were also mindful of the importance of the process and the weight of responsibility on their shoulders.

It was noted that participants were being asked to assimilate a large amount of information, with some asking for further background material. The Panel perceived that this could be due to participants believing that more detailed information would provide the answers that they were seeking, which was unlikely to be the case. The Lead Facilitators confirmed that they and their colleagues were careful not to overload participants with data, as the process had been designed to allow Assembly Members to reach conclusions on the basis of the video presentations and subsequent group deliberations alone, without undertaking additional research. It was also acknowledged that conducting the Citizens' Assembly entirely online was more tiring for participants than the more usual face-to-face format.

Given some of the feedback and questions raised by participants, it was proposed that an additional 'framing' presentation should be delivered by the Group Director, Strategy and Innovation, on behalf of the Government of Jersey. The Panel agreed that this would help to reinforce the purpose of the Citizens' Assembly and how it had come into being, as well as to dispel any misconceptions regarding what could be discussed and the desired outputs at the end of the process.

4th Meeting
29.03.21

Panel discussion: remainder of Block 2.

A6. The Panel considered the remainder of the Block 2 content, consisting of 2 presentations and associated factsheets relating to offsetting.

The Panel supported having 2 presentations, the first to explain the concept and the second to add more detail in specific areas. It was agreed that whilst appearing a straightforward concept, offsetting was likely to play a key role in the journey to net-zero emissions and would therefore generate significant interest and questions from the Assembly.

The Panel made the following observations, which it was agreed would be useful to include in the presentations, as well as the supporting materials:

- participants should be asked to consider whether the purchase of carbon offsets should be viewed as a means of achieving carbon neutrality;
- consideration of the potential problems and trade-offs involved in such a strategy (without steering participants) would also be helpful ;
- Jersey did not have an industrial base so could not make domestic offsets in the same way as the UK, nor could meaningful offsetting be achieved by planting trees locally; and
- an indication of the likely costs was required, in accordance with available data, along with the expectation that the price of offsets was expected to increase over time.

It was agreed that the presentations and factsheets should be updated accordingly.

Panel discussion: outline design, speakers and factsheets - Block 3.

A7. Having previously considered the material, the Panel provided comments on the outline design and proposed speakers for Block 3 – Heating, Cooking and Cooling, Sustainable Finance and Renewable Energy.

The Panel noted that there was a high level of content in Block 3, but considered that it was essential for all energy stakeholders (primarily the utility companies) who wished to do so to be given the opportunity to present to the Citizens' Assembly. The Panel also recalled that these entities would be presenting in the capacity of 'Informants' as their submissions, to some extent, would reflect their commercial interests. Equally, oil companies for example, could be expected to inform the Assembly about alternative fuel products, which would provide useful background.

Members commented that the transition to a carbon neutral future included, by definition, reducing the reliance placed on fossil fuels. It was therefore suggested that, as utility companies were offering to fund the purchase of carbon offsets, it should be made clear to participants that offsets would both increase in price over time and eventually run out altogether.

The Panel also agreed that it was essential for Sustainable Finance to be considered by the Citizens' Assembly, given Jersey's reliance on the offshore finance industry. It was a wide-ranging subject however, so it would be important that discussions remained focused on relevant topics.

It was noted that the Block 3 Factsheets would be circulated shortly, to enable the Panel to review and provide comments before distribution to the Assembly during the week commencing 12th April.

Written
Submissions.

A8. The Panel recalled that, in the period since the last meeting, it had agreed a future approach to considering written submissions. It had been agreed that Government officers would review submissions to ensure they were not offensive, libellous or contravened data protection protocols before they were published on the Jersey Climate Conversation website and that the Panel would simply be asked to review in terms of how the content should inform future content blocks. The Panel review would therefore focus on matters for participants to consider in their deliberations, rather than any points of factual accuracy that needed to be addressed.

Having considered the written submissions to date, the Panel agreed that there had been a good level of engagement from diverse sections of the community. There had been much statistical information provided from some quarters, but also suggestions for matters that the Assembly might usefully consider, such as vehicle sharing as an alternative to car ownership.

It was agreed that information to answer specific questions should be available in case they were raised by participants, such as the submission implying that there was no world shortage of lithium, which Members felt was not entirely accurate.

The mix of submissions from interested parties had also raised ancillary issues, such as traffic congestion and restructuring transport, which were valid, although not necessarily relevant to decarbonisation. The Panel recognised that certain co-benefits existed and had already been highlighted in the Sustainable Transport Policy, and acknowledged that these would be relevant when the Assembly started to formulate its position on the pace of change and appropriate target date for becoming carbon neutral, as well as its recommendations for a just transition.

Media.

A9. It was noted that the Chair Convener had given an interview on BBC Radio Jersey ahead of the start of Block 2 and that a general press release would be issued at the end of the Block, to provide a summary of the issues considered by the Citizens' Assembly. This release would be shared with Panel Members.

Forthcoming
meetings.

A10. The Panel noted that its final scheduled meeting would take place on 19th April 2021, to review the content for Block 4.

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 15.58 hours.