

EH

JERSEY CARBON NEUTRAL CITIZENS' ASSEMBLY ADVISORY PANEL

(5th Meeting)

17th May 2021 at 14.30 hours**PART A (Non-Exempt)**

All members were present.

L. Bentley, Chief Executive Officer, Royal Meteorological Society - Chair  
 F. Barnes, retired (formerly Oxera and FCA)  
 R. Harker, Head of Technology, Digital Jersey  
 R. Diski, Lead of Just Transition Projects, New Economics Foundation  
 J. Hopley, Chair, Jersey Energy Forum  
 T. Park, Principal Advisor, Energy, Environment and Sustainability, Behavioural Insights Team

In attendance -

S. Skelton, Group Director, Strategy and Innovation, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance  
 L. Jones, Senior Policy Officer, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance  
 L. Magris, Head of Sustainability and Foresight, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance  
 E. Heyes, Research and Project Officer, States Greffe  
 M. Magalhaes, Research and Project Officer, States Greffe (observer)  
 E. Robbins, Chair Convenor, Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change (observer)  
 D. Beddoes, Involve  
 P. Keane, New Citizenship Project

Note: The Minutes of this meeting comprise Part A only.

Welcome and Introductions.

A1. Attendees were welcomed to the final meeting of the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change Advisory Panel by the Chair, Professor Bentley.

Ms. E. Heyes from the States Greffe, responsible for taking the minutes of the meeting, introduced herself to the Panel.

Minutes.

A2. The Minutes of the meeting of 29<sup>th</sup> March 2021, having previously been circulated, were taken as read and were confirmed.

Conflicts of interest

A3. No conflicts of interest were declared by Members in respect of the matters to be discussed during the meeting.

Actions from last meeting

A4. The Panel noted the following matters arising from the last meeting which had all been addressed:

(1) Feedback thoughts on how best to provide the Citizens' Assembly with an independent overview of the energy sector, to include info on bio-fuels;

- (2) Comments on sustainable finance presentation; and
- (3) Panel Members were asked to let Ms. Jones know if they wish to observe any of the pre-launch events.

Confirming  
agreements  
made since last  
meeting

A5. The Panel confirmed the agreements that had been made since the last meeting:

- (1) To use a supplementary vote system; and
- (2) The Advisory Panel were asked to consider the accuracy of the statement made around the relative costs of different fuel types. They concluded that there are many different factors that affect the costs of heating a house and that it was not possible to make a blanket statement on the relative overall costs.

Citizens'  
Assembly  
Block 4

A6. Panel members agreed on the following confidentiality statement:

*'The Advisory Panel members understand that they are being given early sight of the high level outputs of the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change for the sole purpose of being able to review the Citizens' Assembly process as a whole and to inform further advice to the Government of Jersey on the conclusion of the project. They understand that they are not being asked to feedback, suggest any changes to, alter or in any way influence those recommendations, and that they have no means of doing so. Advisory Panel members will not share the outputs with any third party until the recommendations report has been published and is in the public domain.'*

The Panel were given a summary of Block 4 and informed that an additional vote was introduced on the date for banning fossil fuel vehicles in Jersey, after it was found that two recommendations gave conflicting dates.

It was noted that the group facilitators found it difficult to stop participants from adding further content to the recommendations during the break-out room discussions.

On the topic of offsetting emissions, the Panel were told that the Assembly discussed this but did not vote on a date.

The Panel were shown the voting results of the Citizens' Assembly on the priority of recommendations, the date for Carbon Neutrality and the date for the ban of fossil fuel vehicles.

The Panel proceeded to discuss the overall Citizens' Assembly process.

Concerns were raised that the Government could try and avoid acting on the recommendations of the Citizens' Assembly by using the excuse that the goal of being Carbon Neutral by 2030 is an unrealistic one. The importance of how the output of the Citizens' Assembly is framed and how the Government should respond was agreed. The Panel agreed that the progress towards achieving the recommendations was more important than the specifics of the report. It was also noted that the change of Government at the next election in 2022 should be kept in mind.

Panel Members discussed the trade-offs and costs of the recommendations and made the point that if the recommendations were able to grasp the limitations then they would have more power. The Panel were told that the Assembly were asked not to focus on the details but that there was discussion on how things would be paid for and who would pay for them.

5th Meeting  
17.05.21

Professor Bentley, asked Lead Facilitator, Dr. Beddoes, how she felt the Citizens' Assembly went. In response, Dr. Beddoes said she believed that the Citizens' Assembly Members were dealt a hard task, particularly in choosing dates and that a lot of the Assembly Members were worried about the responsibility. The Panel learnt that during Block 1 there was a considerable amount of scepticism and cynicism within the Assembly, but that by the end almost all participants were enthusiastic and committed. Dr. Beddoes stressed the importance of a strong Government response to avoid the return of scientism and cynicism.

Prompted for a response by the Chair, Mr. Skelton and Ms. Magris said that the results of the Citizens' Assembly being in line with what was previously said in States Assembly is a positive outcome but that it is uncertain what the response will be from the States Assembly will be.

Recommendations report

A7. The Panel signed off on the foreword to be included in the recommendations report, which was circulated before the meeting.

The Panel discussed the impact of the French fishery licence on Jersey's energy supply and confirmed that the situation, although significant, did not alter the recommendations made by the Assembly.

Members of the Panel were notified of the next steps in putting together the report. The Citizens' Assembly Members have until the evening of the 17<sup>th</sup> May to make any last comments on the recommendations. On the 18<sup>th</sup> May the Assembly outputs will be sent to the Greffier, Mr. Egan, who will put them into a report. This report will be sent to Citizens' Assembly Members by the 21<sup>st</sup> May, to review and pick out any inaccuracies. The Advisory Panel would also be sent the report on 24<sup>th</sup>/25<sup>th</sup> May to pick up on any inaccuracies related to the role of the Advisory Panel. The final report would then be signed off on the 26<sup>th</sup>/27<sup>th</sup> May ready for the States Assembly meeting on the 28<sup>th</sup> May. The report will be published on the 1<sup>st</sup> June ready to be discussed at the Youth Parliament meeting.

Final thoughts

A8. The Panel took time to reflect on the Citizens' Assembly process as a whole and take stock for the future.

Several Panel Members expressed concern over the volume of information delivered to the Citizens' Assembly in such a short amount of time. The Panel did not feel that Members of the Assembly had sufficient time to grasp what they had been told in the presentations. It was suggested, in the future, to allow more contact time, possibly with the addition of more sessions.

Future role of Assembly Members

A9. Panel Members discussed how to keep Citizens' Assembly Members engaged now that the process had ended. It was said that, although the Members should realise that their role in the Citizens' Assembly has come to an end, they should still feel that they can reach out and get involved in processes going forward.

Professor Bentley inquired whether the Citizens' Assembly had created a WhatsApp (or similar) group to keep in contact. Ms. Jones and Dr. Beddoes both said that they did not know of any such group and commented that the virtual nature of this Assembly made it harder for Members to connect with one another.

Media

A10. Professor Bentley announced that at the beginning of June when the Citizens' Assembly report is published a media release would be sent out and asked Panel Members to support by sharing, retweeting, etc. Ms. Jones told the Panel that she would inform them all when the press release is sent to the media.

4

5th Meeting

17.05.21

Any other  
business

A11. Mr. Skelton took the opportunity to thank members of the Advisory Panel for their participation in the Citizens' Assembly.

There being no further business, the meeting concluded at 15:31 hours.